

## Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee October 26, 2006

## LEGAL ACTION REPORT

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:01 PM

Members Present: Sharon Chadwick, Gal Witmer, Kathy Nabours, Demion Clinko Members Absent: Terry Majewski, Patsy Waterfall, Steve Herzog

Staff Present: Frank S. Podgorski, Michael Taku

2. Regular Cases:

RND 03-10 The Historic Depot-Hertz Sign; 400-418 North Toole Avenue (REVISED) (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

This item will be placed on the next available agenda on Thursday, November 9, 2006 at the request of the City of Tucson's Historic Program Administrator.

HPZ 06-61 Krzysik-New Construction; 716 South Jacobus Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Hank Krzysik, architect, on the construction of a new single-family dwelling in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. Discussion on height of the dwelling in relation to other dwellings in the development zone. The proposed mechanical scheme will be a split system with a condenser in the side yard out of public view. Exposed rafter tails on the front porch and fascia boards on the remainder of the residence. A smooth sand stucco finish to be applied on the exterior walls. Wood double-hung windows with wood sills and a wood French door on the rear elevation will complete the details of this proposal.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval of this proposal with conditions: 1) Front door to be 4-Panel solid wood core or less; 2) All windows to be wood doublehung with wood sills; 3) Color palette and asphalt roof shingles as shown, and; 4) The proposed six (6') foot high stuccoed masonry block wall to extend into the front yard of the residence to screen the industrial area but not to be interpreted as a precedent.

Seconded by Gal Witmer.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0; Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee October 26, 2006 Page 2

HPZ 06-62 Children's Museum-Demolition (Wall) Sidewalks/Landscaping; 200 South 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by David Wilson, architect, on the proposed demolition of a portion of the existing front wall at the Children's Museum (Old Carnegie Library) to allow the front of the building to be viewed from South 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue. The proposed sidewalks and landscaping have been withdrawn from consideration. A wrought iron fence is proposed to provide security of the front of the building after demolition of the wall. The front ramp entryway was also discussed. Acting chair Sharon Chadwick requested that the applicant revise the plan and return for approval of the wrought iron fence and detail on the front entry ramp.

HPZ 06-63 Kennedy-Porch/Windows/Wall/Repair; 236 South 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Harold Poole, City of Tucson, Community Services Department, on the improvements to a single-family dwelling in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. Repair portion of the project will involve restuccing in a dash finish to match the existing residence. Windows to be replaced with wood double-hung and a four-panel solid core wood door for the front entryway. The cement walkway from the street to the front entrance to be redone and the front steps recast. The existing pony wall on the front porch will be rebuilt and a new wood rear porch will be constructed all as shown on the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval with the following condition: 1) Either asphalt shingle or corrugated tin for the rear porch roof.

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

HPZ 06-64 Forester-Demolition/Rehabilitation; 535/537 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by John Keating, Project Manager, on the rehabilitation of two single family structures in the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone. Each structure has a second dwelling unit in the rear yard. One of second dwelling units located at 535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue is an old row house that is proposed to be rehabilitated and converted into a single-family dwelling. The second dwelling unit located at 537 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue is an old adobe structure in imminent danger of collapsing. Mr. Keating presented a structural engineer's report submitted by Jerry Cannon that reports that the cost of rehabilitation of the structure would exceed the value of the dwelling. An existing detached carport and shed located in the rear yard are also proposed for demolition. A six (6') foot high wood fence on the perimeter of the property with wood entry gates is proposed.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee October 26, 2006 Page 3

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend demolition of the existing adobe structure, the existing metal carport and the existing metal shed in the rear yard of 537 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

Further discussion on the second dwelling unit (rowhouse) at 535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Recommendation by both the Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board and plans review subcommittee members to install (6x6) wood posts on the front porch overhang with a cement sidewalk along the front of the residence.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval of the rehabilitation of the second dwelling unit at 535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue with the condition that wood (6x6) posts be installed on the front porch overhang with wood scroll detail at the top of the posts.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

Additional discussion on the front dwelling at 535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Proposed wood double-hung windows to be installed and the front steps to be reconfigured to face toward South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval of the rehabilitation of the front dwelling at 535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue with the following conditions: 1) Wood double hung windows; 2) Front stairs to be oriented toward South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue at the front entryway with metal handrails, and; 3) Investigate the feasibility of restoring the front brick archways on the west (front) elevation.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

Further discussion on the front dwelling at 537 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Discussion on use of wood double-hung windows and orientation of the front stairs to face South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Similar discussion (535 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue) on investigating the feasibility of restoring the front brick archways to their original appearance.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval of the proposed rehabilitation of the front dwelling at 537 South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue with the following conditions: 1) Wood double-hung windows; 2) Front stairs to be oriented toward South 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue at the front entryway with metal handrails, and; 3) Investigate the feasibility of restoring the front brick archways on the west (front) elevation.

•

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee October 26, 2006 Page 4

Seconded by Demion Clinco.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 3-0. Acting Chair Sharon Chadwick did not vote.

- 3. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:
- a. Minor Reviews: Two (2) Minor reviews in the field are requested for Friday, October 27, 2006: 1) 815 South Bean Avenue (Windows/Door) (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone), and; 2) 920 North 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue (Minor Change to Approved Elevations) (West University Historic Preservation Zone)
- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in Historic Preservation Zones are reported to the Department of Neighborhood Resources (791-4605). City staff will investigate/inspect the property of the perceived historic code violation as well as other city code violations on the property.
- d. Projects in Progress: The subcommittee has been informed on the status of the property located at 5301 East Fort Lowell Road in the Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone.
- 4. Meeting adjourned at 2:29 pm.